

NAPTON ON THE HILL PARISH COUNCIL

6 Russell Close
Long Itchington
Southam
Warwickshire
CV47 9QG

Telephone: 07526 144576
E-mail: clerk@naptonpc.org.uk
Web: www.naptonparishcouncil.org.uk



Subject: Comparison of Tenders for a New Multi-Play Unit

Date: Friday 24th January 2025

Prepared By: Courtney Adam (clerk)

Introduction:

This report provides a comparison and analysis of the tenders received for the installation of a new multi-play unit for Granton Playing Field. It aims to assist the council in selecting the most suitable provider by evaluating the tenders against pre-defined criteria.

Overview of Tenders Received:

A total of three tenders were received from the following companies:

- Caloo
- Kompan
- Sovereign

Each tender was evaluated using the scoring matrix, which included the following criteria:

- Cost
- Quality and Durability
- Safety Standards Compliance
- Design and Creativity
- Accessibility and Inclusivity
- Ease of Maintenance
- Environmental Impact
- Company Certifications
- Previous Experience

Comparative Analysis:

- **Cost:** Total cost of the equipment and installation
 - Caloo
 - Metal Unit Option 1 - £8,995.00 + VAT
 - Metal Unit Option 2 - £14,395.00 + VAT
 - Wooden Unit - £14,995.00 + VAT
 - Kompan
 - Metal Unit Option 1 - £19,999.99 + VAT
 - Metal Unit Option 2 - £17387.53 + VAT
 - Sovereign
 - Metal Unit – £16,281.76 + VAT

- Wooden Unit - £12,413.12 + VAT

Analysis: Caloo offer the lowest cost, but Kompan and Sovereign provide extras that Caloo does not.

- **Quality and Durability:** Quality of materials, expected lifespan, and ability to withstand weather and wear
 - Caloo
 - Metal Unit Option 1 – Galvanised Steel Posts with HDPE panels & water resistant HPL platforms – Steel 30-year warranty, HDPE 20-year warranty
 - Metal Unit Option 2 – Combination of stainless steel, aluminium and HPL panels – Steel 30-year warranty, HDPE 10-year warranty
 - Wooden Unit – Pressure treated red wood – 15-year warranty
 - Kompan
 - Metal Unit Option 1 – Steel/Aluminium, HDPE, Plastic, Rope – Aluminium 15-year warranty, HDPE lifetime warranty, everything else 10-year warranty
 - Metal Unit Option 2 - Steel/Aluminium, HDPE, HPL, Plastic, Rope – HDPE lifetime warranty, everything else 10-year warranty
 - Sovereign
 - Metal Unit – Steel – 20-year Warranty
 - Wooden Unit – Larch, Pine, Birch and/or Douglas Fir – 20-year Warranty

Analysis: All companies use similar materials, but Caloo has the longest warranty length for steel while Kompan has a lifetime warranty on HDPE components.

- **Safety Standards Compliance:** Compliance with British or EU safety standards (e.g., EN1176)
 - Caloo
 - Metal Unit Option 1 - Yes
 - Metal Unit Option 2 - Yes
 - Wooden Unit – Yes
 - Kompan – Install turf to ensure that grass is established in the grass mats to give a critical fall height safety assurance. Also provide a post installation inspection via the Play Inspection Company which is best practice and required by most insurers.
 - Metal Unit Option 1 – Yes
 - Metal Unit Option 2 – Yes
 - Sovereign - 5 years, 2x inspections per annum (Free of Charge)
 - Metal Unit – Yes
 - Wooden Unit – Yes

Analysis: All companies comply with safety standards. Kompan provide a post installation independent inspection and ensure grass is established in the grass mats. Sovereign provide a 5-year coverage with 2 inspections per annum for third party equipment as well as their own.

- **Design and Creativity:** Visual appeal, innovative features, and suitability for the age groups intended
 - Caloo
 - Metal Unit Option 1 – Basic design with fewer features and less visual appeal. Mimics the wooden trail already installed on site not allowing for variety in active play. Ages 3-14
 - Metal Unit Option 2 – Modern design with multiple features, including a bannister slide, climbing wall, firemans pole, and wavy cargo net climber. Ages 4-12
 - Wooden Unit - Basic design with fewer features, including a cargo net climber. Ages 5-11
 - Kompan
 - Metal Unit Option 1 – Modern design with multiple features, including a slide, climbing wall, tunnel, wackle bridge and cargo net climber. Ages 4+ 23 users
 - Metal Unit Option 2 – Modern design with multiple features, including a slide, rapella, pipe ladder, overhead ladder and cargo net climber. Ages 6+ 18 users
 - Sovereign
 - Metal Unit – Modern design with multiple features, including a bannister slide, traversing loop & coil climber, firemans pole, and 2 cargo net climbers. Ages 5+
 - Wooden Unit - Modern design with 8 features, including a slide, tyre traverse, clatter bridge, log rope climber and cargo net climber. Ages 5+

Analysis: All companies have offered similar modern designs, but Kompan offer greater selection in the colours used on their equipment.
- **Accessibility and Inclusivity:** Accessibility features for children with disabilities and inclusivity of design
 - Caloo
 - Limited accessibility features; focus on able-bodied children.
 - Kompan
 - Limited accessibility features; focus on able-bodied children.
 - Sovereign
 - Limited accessibility features; focus on able-bodied children.

Analysis: No significant differentiation on this criterion.
- **Ease of Maintenance:** Requirements for cleaning, repairs, and long-term maintenance
 - Caloo
 - Metal Unit Option 1 – Low Maintenance
 - Metal Unit Option 2 - Low Maintenance
 - Wooden Unit - Low Maintenance
 - Kompan
 - Metal Unit Option 1 – Low Maintenance
 - Metal Unit Option 2 – Low Maintenance
 - Sovereign

- Metal Unit – Low Maintenance
- Wooden Unit – Low Maintenance

Analysis: No significant differentiation on this criterion.

- **Environmental Impact:** Use of sustainable materials and eco-friendly practices in manufacturing and installation
 - **Caloo** - No unit specific info but has an Environmental Policy used across all units. (minimise wastage, managing/disposing of waste responsibly, minimise pollution, comply with all relevant environmental legislation, regs and codes of practice)
 - Metal Unit Option 1
 - Wooden Unit – Uses European redwood trees supplied from responsible FSC approved and managed European Mainland Forests
 - **Kompan** – Many of their playground components are made from 95% post-consumer recycled materials (ocean waste, used textiles, food packaging waste, used plastic bags, etc)
 - Metal Unit Option 1 – 32.1% of the materials used are from post-industrial/consumer waste (81.9% of this unit can be recycled at its end of life)
 - Metal Unit Option 2 – 61.5% of the materials used are from post-industrial/consumer waste (98.9% of this unit can be recycled at its end of life)
 - **Sovereign** – No unit specific info but has an Environmental Policy used across all units. (minimise wastage, managing/disposing of waste responsibly, minimise pollution, comply with all relevant environmental legislation, regs and codes of practice)
 - Metal Unit
 - Wooden Unit

Analysis: Kompan demonstrates the strongest environmental commitment.

Scoring Matrix Summary: (Score 1-5)

Criteria	Caloo	Kompan	Sovereign
Cost	10	6	8
Quality and Durability	9	10	9
Safety Standards	8	10	10
Design and Creativity	7	9	8
Accessibility and Inclusivity	6	6	6
Ease of Maintenance	10	10	10
Environmental Impact	8	10	8
Company Certificates	10	10	10
Previous Experience	8	10	8
Total Score Out of 90	76	81	77

Recommendations:

Based on the scoring matrix and analysis:

- **Caloo: 76**
- **Kompan: 81**
- **Sovereign: 77**

Funding:

- £6,281.40 from CIL funds and £14,000.00 from reserves totalling in £20,281.40 available.